

A paper presented at the 2010 Christian Scholars' Conference,
Lipscomb University, Nashville, Tennessee June 3-5, 2010,
by Edwin Broadus, Burlington, Ontario, Canada

Disciple Beginnings on the Niagara Frontier and in Central New York 1826-1836

In August 1826 Alexander Campbell received two letters from the Philomathean Society at the Baptists' Literary and Theological Seminary in Hamilton, New York. One, from the corresponding secretary, asked Campbell to quit sending the *Christian Baptist*. The other, by Conant Sawyer, asked him to continue supplying it, noting that "some have been very anxious to keep it, and others have been very bitter against it."^[1] This campus controversy was representative of the burgeoning disagreement over Campbell's writings, not only among Regular Baptists in New York, but also, to a lesser extent among the Freewill Baptists and the Christian Connection. The result within a few years was the organization of several Disciples churches.

In 1827 the *Christian Baptist* (1823-1830) first listed subscribers in New York and, two years later, across the Niagara River in Upper Canada. These included Thomas McIntyre, a leading Christian Connection preacher in Upper Canada, who became an agent in 1829, J. Wilkinson of Syracuse, who subscribed in 1829 and who helped form Disciples churches in Central New York, Timothy Brewster, a Baptist minister in Ellisburg, who in 1829 subscribed for himself and several others, and William A. Scranton of Rochester, a Baptist minister who in 1831 became an agent for Campbell's new paper, the *Millennial Harbinger*.^[2] Initially Baptists who accepted Campbell's views sought to remain where they were. In 1829, Brewster and two associates wrote that to their knowledge all those in their area who had accepted the views of Campbell were still in good standing with the Black River Baptist Association.^[3] In Upper Canada, Daniel Wiers, who preached for the Baptists in Beamsville, took issue with his congregation over Calvinism. With church backing he went in 1828 to Hamilton, New York, to the Baptist seminary, where the church hoped he could be reclaimed to orthodoxy. However, to their dismay, he returned after several months as an advocate of Campbell's writings and anxious for the church to accept his new views. When he refused to recant, he was excommunicated at the end of 1829.^[4]

Campbell's growing impact in New York was noted in "Journal of a Traveller," by Francis W. Emmons in the August 1830 *Millennial Harbinger*. Emmons found a Baptist minister in Schenectady who would not read Campbell, because "he is a Sandemanian" and "makes water baptism regeneration." In Little Falls a Presbyterian minister who had been a Baptist said, "Campbell is doing a world of mischief to the Baptist denomination." Emmons journeyed on to Hamilton to the Baptist seminary, where he had graduated six years earlier, and gave the library Campbell's *Living Oracles*, his debates with Owen and Maccalla, and the last two issues of the *Christian Baptist*. After Emmons reached Rochester, he renewed an old friendship with a Baptist minister. When Emmons told him he was headed for Ohio, his friend warned him that "Camp-

bellism had spoiled the people there.” Feigning ignorance, Emmons asked, “What is Campbellism?” The minister replied, “Art thou only a stranger in these parts, and knowest not the desolations which Alexander Campbell is effecting? You will find enough of it where you are going.” He then told about a neighboring Baptist minister, William Scranton, who had been excommunicated because he was a Campbellite. When Emmons asked more about “Brother Scranton,” he was told not to call him “brother.” “He is a bad man, and not worthy of that name.”

Meanwhile, a young school teacher in Syracuse, Ann Lathrop, was excommunicated by the Baptists for reading and lending Campbell’s paper. When some of the women in the church sympathized with her at her hearing, it was ruled that “the sisters should not vote.” Campbell was moved to call her “the protomartyr of the Apostles’ doctrine in the state of New York.”^[5] Some of the Baptists in that part of New York formed the state’s first Disciples church west of the Hudson River meeting at Throopsville near Auburn in Cayuga County. The church’s origin is obscure, but it may have been related to Ann Lathrop’s stand in nearby Syracuse. Nearly a century later the church recalled, “In 1830 a few people seceded from the parent congregation, the Throopsville Baptist Church, for the purpose of being known as the Disciples of the Lord Jesus, and taking the word of God as their only rule of faith and practice.” Thomas D. Foster was the first elder, and Joshia (sic) Sherwood, Israel Clapp, and William Allen were deacons.^[6] This church is mentioned in an unsigned report in early 1832 as having forty-five members who were “progressing in the cause of truth.”^[7]

Within three years five more churches were planted in a three-county area around Auburn. In Cayuga County they were Victory (1833) and Cato, also called Ira (1833); to the west Butler (1832) in Wayne County; and to the east Pompey (1833) and Cicero (1833) in Onondaga County.^[8] Some may have formed, in part, in reaction to the heresy trial of Ann Lathrop in nearby Syracuse. Elder Thomson, minister of the Baptist church in Cicero, had his curiosity about “Campbellism” aroused at a church council. Wanting to know more, he subscribed to the *Millennial Harbinger* and became a staunch advocate of Campbell’s views. About the same time Elder John Milton Bartlett,^[9] Baptist minister at Victory, and Elder Lowell, Baptist minister at Pompey, embraced the same position.^[10] North of Syracuse, in Jefferson County, several Baptists in Ellisburg and Carthage withdrew under the leadership of Timothy Brewster to establish Disciples churches in 1832.^[11]

The Christian Connection was also adversely affected by Campbell and the Disciples in Central New York. In July 1834 Jasper J. Moss, a traveling Disciples evangelist from Ohio who was born near Syracuse and who frequently returned to the state to preach, reported that in Marion in Wayne County twenty from the Christian denomination had been immersed (the Christians practiced adult immersion but did not require it for membership). He then reported that Brother R (Solomon B. Rose –EB)^[12] was spending the summer there, meeting with the Christian Connection, and “boldly pleading with them for reformation. He says he thinks it is not best to leave a house because it is dirty,

but if possible to cleanse it.” Moss predicted that the leaven that was at work would permeate the entire mass, both in New York and in Canada. However, opposition from some of the Christian Connection leaders mounted, and in early 1835 a debate was held between the Reformers and the Christians at the Methodist Chapel in Weedsport, in neighboring Cayuga County. At the outset the Reformers were represented by Bartlett, Moss, and William Hunter, who had once been part of the Christian Connection. During the debate Bartlett was replaced by Silas Shepard, who was in the process of moving to nearby Auburn where he would edit a new paper, the *Primitive Christian*. The Christians were represented by Obediah (sic) E. Morrill, and he was joined during the debate by one of their evangelists from North Carolina, Joseph Thomas. The debate focused on the role of the Holy Spirit in conversion. Both sides claimed victory.[13]

In Western New York, in the Rochester area, Campbell’s views took root among diverse persons, seemingly unacquainted with one another at the beginning. The first Disciples church in that region was at Elba, six miles north of Batavia in Genesee County. In 1830 William Hayden, a Disciples evangelist in Ohio, baptized Jewett Frost, who had moved to Ohio from Riga, New York, between Rochester and Batavia. Wanting to share his new faith with his family, Frost went back to his native state in 1832, and after about fifteen people were immersed a congregation was set in order May 28th.[14]

The early work of Disciples around Batavia was significantly impacted by events in Beamsville, on the Canadian side of the Niagara River. After Daniel Wiers’ excommunication by the Baptists, two itinerant Freewill Baptist preachers, David Marks and Freeborn W. Straight, heard about this and stopped to see him in June 1830 on their return to Western New York. A few weeks later, Wiers attended a Freewill Baptist conference in New York and was subsequently ordained by the Freewill Baptists. He and Straight became co-workers, and Wiers is credited with introducing Straight to Restoration teachings.[15] By August 1832 Wiers was preaching baptism for the remission of sins and organized a Disciples church near Beamsville at the end of the year.[16] Straight, who founded a Freewill Baptist church in Batavia in 1830, began preaching Campbell’s views in 1832. The church dismissed him and brought in Porter Thomas to undo the damage done by Straight, but by May 1833 Thomas also became a Disciple.

[17] Meanwhile, in 1832, another Freewill Baptist preacher, John M. Yearnshaw, who lived near Rochester, also accepted Campbell’s views. He left the Freewill Baptists when, in reaction to the Christian Connection’s unitarian leanings, they demanded explicit acceptance of trinitarian views. Yearnshaw, who said he was neither unitarian nor trinitarian, objected to being forced to accept “speculative opinions,” and so he left to go where he could enjoy “freedom of thought, liberty of opinion, and independence of mind.”[18]

Thomas continued to work in the Batavia area for a while, probably with the Elba church Frost helped start.[19] Yearnshaw did itinerant preaching while residing in Brockport,[20] and Wiers[21] and Straight[22] focused on Beamsville. Work immediately adjacent to Rochester was difficult at first, in part because of unspecified church problems at Gates.[23] But by early 1834 seven from this church united with

seven from the Baptists and the Christian Connection to form a new church in Greece (now, like Gates, a Rochester suburb). John Spoor preached there.[24]

The Rochester area was the home of William Scranton,[25] who by the time of Emmons' visit in 1830 was branded a Campbellite and who influenced other ministers in the area. In 1832, as an agent for the *Millennial Harbinger*, he supplied the first two volumes for Spoor and the second for Samuel Clarke, a leader in the Greece church.[26] He also knew William Hunter, mentioned earlier, who later became a Disciples minister and editor, but who in early 1833 was still in good standing with the Christian Connection.[27] Scranton's associates also included two defrocked Christian Connection preachers, Benjamin Howard and Zephen F. Green. Both were talented, persuasive speakers who had been disciplined by the church for unidentified reasons, although evidence suggests Howard's problems were with money and Green's with alcohol.[28]

In April 1833 Howard crossed Lake Ontario to preach in Upper Canada in the Cobourg area, where Thomas McIntyre, a Christian Connection preacher, lived and worked. This was also the home of Joseph Ash, who three years later broke with the Christian Connection and helped found a Disciples church. If Howard expected a warm welcome from McIntyre and Ash he was quickly disappointed. Ash had read about him in the *Christian Palladium* and wrote Campbell to warn others about him, since Howard claimed to be a Reformer and a Disciple.[29] McIntyre wrote Joseph Badger, editor of the *Palladium*, "In as much as you have driven him into Canada, I want you to come over and drive him back again." [30]

However, Howard was not easily discouraged but instead recruited Zephen Green to come and assist him. That summer Scranton and Hunter also crossed the lake to spend a short time with Howard, attending a meeting that included about five hundred people.[31] Working together, Howard and Green established churches in 1833 in Baltimore and Brighton, both within twenty miles of Cobourg, and then the following year they moved farther east along Lake Ontario to Prince Edward County, where they planted congregations in Hillier, Hallowell, and Athol townships. Howard left Upper Canada by 1837 for Nova Scotia and New Brunswick, where he preached a few years and established several Disciples churches. Green remained about a decade and in fact married one of his converts in Prince Edward County after his first wife died. He worked primarily in Prince Edward County and on the Niagara Peninsula.[32]

Thus, by 1833 at least nine preachers had renounced previous affiliations to stand with the Disciples. These included Straight, Thomas, Wiers, and Yearnshaw from the Freewill Baptists, Scranton from the Regular Baptists, Green, Howard, and Hunter from the Christian Connection, and Spoor, of unidentified background.[33] But despite these impressive inroads among ministers in Western New York, in the early 1830s this did not result in as many new churches and additional members there as in Upper Canada and Central New York.

These events in New York and Upper Canada caught the notice of Disciples in Ohio where two evangelists, William Hayden and Jasper J. Moss, determined by 1832 to

visit these preachers and new churches. Hayden had traveled with Walter Scott as his song leader and exhorter a few years earlier when Scott was baptizing a thousand people a year. Moss had also preached effectively in Ohio before he began traveling with Hayden. Both men were attracted to New York – Moss because he was born in the Syracuse area, and had relatives there, and Hayden because Jewett Frost, mentioned earlier, wanted Hayden to help teach Frost's brother and friends.[34] The two men made their first visit in 1832,[35] and, according to reports in the *Millennial Harbinger*, they continued to come the next twenty years. They usually went to the Rochester, Syracuse, and Buffalo areas, and often they also crossed into Upper Canada to visit churches there. Their work was critical in forging the Disciples in Western and Central New York into a united fellowship and in establishing and reinforcing ties with Disciples in their area of strength in Ohio.

Their initial challenge in Western New York was to unite ministers from disparate backgrounds, and so they called a meeting near Batavia November 2-4, 1833 with Thomas, Wiers, Yearnshaw, Scranton, Green, Howard, and Spoor. (Only Straight and Hunter were missing.) Hayden said, "We exhorted each other to love and bear with each other, to be long suffering and kind, while holding forth 'the truth' to enlighten, warm, and quicken the world." He also wrote Campbell that he thought Ash's report about Howard was erroneous.[36] By the beginning of the following summer, Moss, Straight, and Thomas all visited Ash in Cobourg,[37] and Moss followed up with a letter July 1, 1834 to Ash and McIntyre to try to bring reconciliation with Howard and Green. His pleas went unheeded by Ash and Wiers, for neither had confidence in the two men.

[38]

Hayden and Moss also visited the Syracuse area in 1833. Hayden returned home in November after more than two months in New York, but Moss stayed all of 1834, concentrating his efforts around Syracuse, where he immersed his sister. He gave moral support to John M. Bartlett when the Baptist association attempted to discipline him, and he also worked with new Disciples churches in the area. During this period he made three trips to Canada and also spent time in the Rochester and Buffalo areas. His reports to the *Harbinger* tell of the progress of the Disciples in New York and Upper Canada. In March one hundred were immersed, an equal number came from the Baptists, and one preacher was converted. June 1st he sent news of forty-one baptisms in Canada.[39] In July he reported immersing twenty from the Christian Connection.[40] At the same time he reported new churches at Clarence and Lancaster in Erie County, near Buffalo, where ninety-five were immersed in two months, and another thirty-six, apparently Baptists, "left the streets of Babylon." He also stated that the number baptized in Canada in the previous nine months had grown to about one hundred.[41] The breakthrough near Buffalo was especially encouraging, since progress in Western New York had been very slow until then. In 1833 M. G. Lewis had written the *Harbinger* in June, seeking assistance and expressing the hope that Hayden and Moss would stop for a short time on their way east to help form a church.[42] They may not have stopped in September, but Moss came the next June and said what was happening there "exceeded every thing in

this state.” One Sunday he preached to between twelve and fifteen hundred people.[43] In addition to the Clarence and Lancaster churches, by 1836 another was planted at Williamsville in Erie County, and later one was added at Transit.[44]

In 1834 Moss estimated that there were about nine hundred Disciples in New York between Buffalo and the Syracuse region.[45] If this was accurate, membership easily exceeded a thousand when Campbell visited in 1836. Measured by the phenomenal growth of the Disciples in Ohio and Kentucky, progress was slow in New York – a sentiment at times reflected in their reports. Despite opposition from Baptist leaders, much of the early growth in New York came at the expense of that denomination, especially around Syracuse. Conversely, comparatively few from the Christian Connection or Freewill Baptists followed their ministers to become Disciples. Leaders in both denominations were quick to oppose what they called Campbellism. David Marks of the Freewill Baptists attended their August 1833 Yearly Meeting in Western New York to deal with what he called “the havoc Campbellism was making” and succeeded in getting three of their four dissident ministers excommunicated.[46] (Only Yearnshaw escaped, because he had earlier received an honorable dismissal.) In the Christian Connection, the two leading ministers in Western New York, Joseph Badger and David Millard, began speaking out against Campbell in the *Christian Palladium* by 1834. Like the Freewill and the Regular Baptists, they subscribed to experiential conversion and thus disagreed with Campbell’s rejection of direct operation of the Spirit in conversion and his belief that baptism is for the remission of sins.[47]

Campbell’s visit in 1836 was the culmination of this pioneer period for the Disciples in New York. Campbell himself considered what he called “a tour of the north-east” important, devoting fifteen pages in the October and November issues of the *Harbinger* to his travels in New York. He stopped first at Clarence and Williamsville in the Buffalo area, and then after a side trip to Niagara Falls went to Brockport and Greece near Rochester. After speaking in Rochester he journeyed to Auburn, in Central New York, where he met the aged Timothy Brewster as well as Ann Lathrop. From Auburn he crossed into Onondaga County, where he visited Syracuse, Cicero and Pompey before leaving for Albany and New England. An excerpt from his letter to his wife, Selina, from Syracuse July 8, 1836 provides his own evaluation of his visit to New York:

I have never been more busily engaged in all my life than on the present tour. I am like one settling in a new country, where everything is to do. I have labored incessantly since I came into this State, disabusing the public mind and teaching the disciples. There is a powerful opposition consolidated against the truth. I have spoken some thirty-seven times since I left home....

I am really very tired and willing to seek repose, and could wish that my journey and my furlough were completed, but I must patiently bear the toil and endure the pain in hope of the reward. I have the great pleasure of enlightening many, of relieving the distressed and broken in spirit, and of making some rich in the faith and hope of Christ. I have left a good odor for Christ in every place.... All the country behind me desire my return. But, unfortunately, I have to leave every place just when I get the prejudices broken down a little. This is a hard, worldly, skeptical place.[48]

Perhaps most of the Disciples Campbell met in New York would agree that it was “a hard, worldly, skeptical place,” and Campbell himself had likely entertained the hope that the message he disseminated first through the *Christian Baptist* and then through the *Millennial Harbinger* would, by 1836, have a much more profound influence than it did. But people were reading his publications, and more importantly many were led to rethink their beliefs and to reform their practices. There were not mass accessions, but in the decade surveyed here, we have been able to identify about a dozen preachers who left the Christian Connection, or the Freewill Baptists, or the Regular Baptists. Scores of members left those churches, especially the Regular Baptists, and total additions in New York and adjoining portions of Upper Canada could be counted in the hundreds by 1836. There was not the reformation hoped for within these other churches, but even so it was no small beginning.

- Edwin Broadus, June 2010

Some Early Disciples Churches in Central and Western New York

Town (or Township)	County	Date of Establishment
Throopsville	Cayuga	1830
Ellisburg	Jefferson	1832
Carthage	Jefferson	1832
Elba	Genesee	1832
Butler	Wayne	1832
Victory	Cayuga	1833
Cato (Ira)	Cayuga	1833
Pompey	Onondaga	1833
Cicero	Onondaga	1833
Greece	Monroe	1834
Clarence	Erie	1834
Lancaster	Erie	1834
Williamsville	Erie	1835

[1] *Christian Baptist*, Nov. 1826, 84-89.

[2] *CB*, Jan. 1829, 144; Aug. 1829, 24; Sept. 1829, 48; *Millennial Harbinger*, June 1831, 288.

[3] *CB*, Feb. 1830, 153.

[4] Edwin Broadus, *How the Disciples Came Together in Early Ontario*, Beamsville, Ontario: Gospel Herald Foundation, 2009, 117-121.

[5] *Millennial Harbinger*, Mar. 1833, 141-142; Nov. 1836, 484.

[6] "Dedication Services of Church of Christ," Throopsville, N. Y., Nov. 1, 1925, 2-3.

[7] *MH*, Mar. 1832, 141.

[8] *MH*, Mar. 1833, 139; Mar. 1832, 141; Nov. 1833, 576; Mar. 1834, 131.

[9] John Milton Bartlett had been a Baptist minister in New York before he began preaching for the Disciples. He served in the latter capacity until his death in 1868 or 1869 and apparently spent more time in New York than any other Disciples minister during the New York church's first thirty years. When a Baptist, he went by John M. Bartlett, but as a Disciple he usually signed his name as J. Milton Bartlett.

[10] *MH*, Mar. 1833, 141-142; Aug. 1833, 429-430; July 1834, 329-331.

[11] *MH*, Oct. 1832, 471. Campbell called Brewster the first in the region to "avow his allegiance to the Apostles' doctrine." *MH*, Nov. 1836, 484.

[12] *MH*, Aug. 1834, 377-378. Rose, a New York native, began preaching in Canada for the Christian Connection by 1827. For several years he was Clerk at the Annual Conference in Upper Canada, but he resigned this in 1833, apparently to travel as an evangelist for a year. He missed the 1834 conference, was expelled from it in 1835, and was reinstated in 1836. Likely his expulsion was related to his alleged Campbellism. Eventually he left the Christians to work with the Disciples, *Christian Palladium*, Sept. 1832, 110-112; July 1833, 102; Dec. 1833, 262; Feb. 1834, 318; Oct. 5, 1835, 263; Oct. 1, 1836, 99; Joseph Ash, *Reminiscences*, Beamsville, Ontario: Gospel Herald Foundation, 1998 (a reprint of twenty-one articles from the *Christian Worker*, Meaford, Ont., 1882-1884), 22.

[13] *CP*, Mar. 2, 1835, 327; *Primitive Christian*, April 1835, 8; May 1835, 29.

[14] *MH*, Sept. 1832, 413; Aug. 1834, 377-378.

[15] Tradition holds that the two men bought the *Christian Baptist* at a blind auction in Lewisburg, New York on the Niagara River and were converted after reading it. They may have indeed made such a purchase, but Wiers was acquainted with Campbell's teachings before he ever met Straight.

[16] Broadus, 117-124; *Christian Messenger*, Jan. 1833, 28.

[17] Broadus, 124; *PC*, Dec. 1836, 213.

[18] Broadus, 124-125; *CP*, Dec. 1833, 252-254.

[19] Porter Thomas had been ordained by the Freewill Baptists in New York in 1824 and later served with them in New York and Michigan. After becoming a Disciple he preached for a while in Western New York and on the Niagara peninsula in Upper Canada. Later in the 1830s he preached in New York City, and in the middle part of the next decade he was in St. John, N. B.

[20] *MH*, May 1834, 233. John M. Yearnshaw had worked with the Freewill Baptists in New England before moving to the Rochester area in 1831. Soon after becoming a Disciple he moved to the United States, where he was a pioneer preacher on the frontier in Illinois, Wisconsin, Iowa, and Nebraska. He was in the last place in 1869 and so had a long career with the Disciples.

[21] Daniel Wiers, who was a native of the Beamsville area, left there in 1837 or shortly thereafter. He later was a member of the Bible Christians (of Methodist background) and also a botanic physician in Norfolk Co., Ontario. He and his family moved to Michigan about 1862, and he died in Berlin Township, Ionia Co., Michigan Sept. 26, 1869. It is an interesting coincidence that Isaac Errett planted a Disciples church in Berlin Township by 1865, at which time it had ninety members. For more extensive information about Wiers see Broadus, 117-133.

[22] Freeborn W. Straight was born in Washington Co., N. Y. in 1806 and became a Freewill Baptist when he was about twenty-one. He was licensed to preach a year later and soon began traveling with David Marks. After working with the Disciples for a while, he returned to the Freewill Baptists by 1841 and remained with them until his death in 1878.

[23] It is uncertain whether Gates was a Disciples church or perhaps a Baptist or Christian church where some espoused Campbell's views. Gates was William Scranton's home at this time, but it is not known whether he was involved in the church's difficulties.

[24] *MH*, Aug. 1834, 377-378; Sept. 1834, 432.

[25] William Alford Scranton was born in 1798 in Saybrook, Conn., but by the time he married he was living in Oneida Co., N. Y., south of Utica. By 1830 he was living outside of Rochester, in the Town of Gates. In 1841 he and his family moved to Brandon, Mich., to a farm he had purchased there, but he sickened and died very soon after he arrived.

[26] *MH*, Feb. 1832, 96. Spoor's name is misspelled "Spoon" in the list of monthly receipts.

[27] *CP*, Feb. 1833. Joseph Badger, editor, described Hunter as "a respectable young minister." As a Disciple, Hunter in 1835 began publishing the *Christian Investigator* in Eastport, Maine.

[28] Howard was living in the Town of Greece in 1831 when all his property was put up for auction to satisfy his creditors. *Rochester Republican*, Dec. 14, 1831. In 1843, after he moved to the Maritimes, he was accused of mishandling funds in his care. When A. G. Comings made the accusation public in his journal, *Genius of Christianity*, Howard sued Comings for slander. The case was thrown out of court. *MH*, Nov. 1843, 517ff. Green was disciplined in the 1840s by at least three churches in Upper Canada for drunkenness, according to Joseph Ash. Ash, 52.

[29] *MH*, Sept. 1833, 472.

[30] *CP*, June 1833, 61-62.

[31] *MH*, Aug. 1833, 432.

[32] For more about Howard and Green see Broadus, 155-167.

[33] In June 1833 Samuel Clarke, who lived in Greece, near Rochester, said, "Some seven or eight ministers, (some of them under my immediate observation) have come out in favor of Reform." He may not have included Wiers, who hailed from Upper Canada. *MH*, Sept. 1833, 471.

[34] A. S. Hayden, *Early History of the Disciples in the Western Reserve, Ohio*, Cincinnati: Chase and Hall, 1875, 180, 196-197.

[35] *MH*, Mar. 1833, 141-142.

[36] *MH*, Dec. 1833, 616.

[37] *MH*, Aug. 1834, 381-382.

[38] Ash, 49-50.

[39] *MH*, Apr. 1834, 187; July 1834, 329-331, 333.

[40] *MH*, Aug. 1834, 377.

[41] *MH*, Aug. 1834, 377-378.

[42] *MH*, Aug. 1833, 429.

[43] *MH*, Aug. 1834, 378.

[44] *MH*, Oct. 1836, 433-434; Feb. 1839, 96; July 1839, 333

[45] *MH*, Sept. 1834, 472.

[46] Marilla Marks, editor, *Memoirs of the Life of David Marks, Minister of the Gospel*, Dover, N. H.: Freewill Baptist Printing Establishment, 1846, 316-317, 321.

[47] *CP*, Sept. 1, 1845, 140.

[48] Robert Richardson, *Memoirs of Alexander Campbell*, Vol. II, Philadelphia: J. B. Lippincott and Company, 1868, 1869, 415-416.